



FINAL DRAFT

International Standard

ISO/FDIS 33406

Approaches for the production of reference materials with qualitative properties

*Approches pour la production de matériaux de référence avec des
propriétés qualitatives*

ISO/TC 334

Secretariat: **SABS**

Voting begins on:
2024-01-31

Voting terminates on:
2024-03-27

RECIPIENTS OF THIS DRAFT ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT,
WITH THEIR COMMENTS, NOTIFICATION OF ANY
RELEVANT PATENT RIGHTS OF WHICH THEY ARE AWARE
AND TO PROVIDE SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION.

IN ADDITION TO THEIR EVALUATION AS
BEING ACCEPTABLE FOR INDUSTRIAL, TECHNO-
LOGICAL, COMMERCIAL AND USER PURPOSES, DRAFT
INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS MAY ON OCCASION HAVE
TO BE CONSIDERED IN THE LIGHT OF THEIR POTENTIAL
TO BECOME STANDARDS TO WHICH REFERENCE MAY BE
MADE IN NATIONAL REGULATIONS.



COPYRIGHT PROTECTED DOCUMENT

© ISO 2024

All rights reserved. Unless otherwise specified, or required in the context of its implementation, no part of this publication may be reproduced or utilized otherwise in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, or posting on the internet or an intranet, without prior written permission. Permission can be requested from either ISO at the address below or ISO's member body in the country of the requester.

ISO copyright office
CP 401 • Ch. de Blandonnet 8
CH-1214 Vernier, Geneva
Phone: +41 22 749 01 11
Email: copyright@iso.org
Website: www.iso.org

Published in Switzerland

Contents

Page

Foreword	iv
Introduction	v
1 Scope	1
2 Normative references	1
3 Terms and definitions	1
4 Qualitative properties	1
5 Meeting technical and production requirements	2
5.1 Characterization	2
5.1.1 General considerations	2
5.1.2 Materials characterized based on provenance	2
5.1.3 Materials characterized for identity based on measurements	2
5.1.4 Characterization by a combination of methods	3
5.2 Application of metrological traceability to qualitative determinations	4
5.2.1 General	4
5.2.2 Metrological traceability	5
5.2.3 Reference data and reference materials for qualitative determinations	5
5.2.4 Qualitative value assigned based on provenance	5
5.3 Measurement uncertainty and confidence in qualitative values	6
5.3.1 General considerations	6
5.3.2 Measurement uncertainty	6
5.3.3 Confidence in qualitative values	7
5.4 General considerations for the selection of statistical approaches	8
5.5 Assessment of homogeneity	9
5.5.1 General considerations	9
5.5.2 Experimental designs for homogeneity assessment for qualitative values	9
5.5.3 Statistical approaches for homogeneity assessment for qualitative properties	10
5.6 Assessment of stability	12
5.6.1 General considerations for stability assessment	12
5.6.2 Designs for experimental stability studies for qualitative properties	13
5.7 Commutability assessment	15
5.7.1 General considerations	15
5.7.2 Commutability assessment for qualitative properties	16
5.7.3 Commutability statement	16
Annex A (informative) Guidance for DNA and protein reference materials	18
Annex B (informative) Expressing confidence in qualitative values	21
Annex C (informative) Statistical procedures	28
Annex D (informative) Examples of homogeneity and stability studies of reference materials with qualitative properties	32
Bibliography	37

Foreword

ISO (the International Organization for Standardization) is a worldwide federation of national standards bodies (ISO member bodies). The work of preparing International Standards is normally carried out through ISO technical committees. Each member body interested in a subject for which a technical committee has been established has the right to be represented on that committee. International organizations, governmental and non-governmental, in liaison with ISO, also take part in the work. ISO collaborates closely with the International Electrotechnical Commission (IEC) on all matters of electrotechnical standardization.

The procedures used to develop this document and those intended for its further maintenance are described in the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 1. In particular, the different approval criteria needed for the different types of ISO document should be noted. This document was drafted in accordance with the editorial rules of the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2 (see www.iso.org/directives).

ISO draws attention to the possibility that the implementation of this document may involve the use of (a) patent(s). ISO takes no position concerning the evidence, validity or applicability of any claimed patent rights in respect thereof. As of the date of publication of this document, ISO had not received notice of (a) patent(s) which may be required to implement this document. However, implementers are cautioned that this may not represent the latest information, which may be obtained from the patent database available at www.iso.org/patents. ISO shall not be held responsible for identifying any or all such patent rights.

Any trade name used in this document is information given for the convenience of users and does not constitute an endorsement.

For an explanation of the voluntary nature of standards, the meaning of ISO specific terms and expressions related to conformity assessment, as well as information about ISO's adherence to the World Trade Organization (WTO) principles in the Technical Barriers to Trade (TBT), see <http://www.iso.org/iso/foreword.html>.

This document was prepared by Technical Committee ISO/TC 334, *Reference materials*.

Any feedback or questions on this document should be directed to the user's national standards body. A complete listing of these bodies can be found at www.iso.org/members.html.

Introduction

In 2015, ISO/TC 334 (formerly ISO/REMCO) published ISO/TR 79, which summarized the state of the art of the production of reference materials (RMs) with qualitative properties. The lack of an international vocabulary for terms and definitions for qualitative properties added an extra challenge in 2015 and ISO/TR 79 did not define or limit the use of the term "qualitative property". "Qualitative property" was therefore used as superordinate for nominal and ordinal properties. "Categorical properties" is a synonym for "qualitative properties". ISO/TR 79 lists examples of RMs that either have a certified value for a qualitative property or can be considered as in-house RMs characterized for a qualitative property. The examples listed are based on the principles elaborated in ISO Guide 35 and ISO Guide 80, but ISO/TR 79 did not undergo a consensus-building process.

For RMs, nominal properties are a particular kind of qualitative property (the other kind are ordinal properties). The identity of a polychlorinated biphenyl (PCB) and the species of a maple tree (genus *Acer*) are nominal properties where the values of the properties are the particular chemical species name or biological species name (e.g. PCB 105 and *Acer saccharinum*, respectively). The former has more than 200 possible values, the latter more than 160. The only meaningful comparison between values of a nominal property is whether they are identical or different.

Ordinal properties have values that can be ordered (i.e. ranked) from smallest to largest or from lowest to highest, but for which neither differences nor ratios are meaningful, even when their values are represented numerically.

EXAMPLE 1 Stage, as defined by the American Joint Committee on Cancer, is a property of solid tumour cancers (e.g. breast, colon or lung), whose possible values are the Roman numerals I, II, III and IV. However, one is not entitled to say either that stage IV is two times "worse" than stage II or that the difference in severity between stages III and I is the same as the difference in severity between stages IV and II.

EXAMPLE 2 The Mohs hardness of a mineral is expressed relative to a scale ranging from 1 (for talc) to 10 (for diamond) and can include half-integer values (e.g. 5 ½ for enstatite). However, fluorite (4) is not two times harder than gypsum (2), nor is the difference in hardness between topaz (8) and apatite (5) the same as the difference in hardness between quartz (7) and fluorite (4).

There are no unambiguous rules for expressing qualitative properties in various fields such as chemistry and biology. The following examples illustrate the confusion that exists. Qualitative properties can be described in different ways depending on the individual property or even on the way in which a specific property is expressed. For example, "colour" can be seen as a qualitative property of which "red" is a value. Alternatively, it has been proposed that "colour" is a general property of which "red" is an individual case. Moreover, a pure colour can be described by the corresponding wavelengths of light, with a band from 625 nm to 740 nm for red light. Hence, the qualitative property "colour" can be assigned a quantitative (or semi-quantitative) value such as 700 nm.

Qualitative value assignments can also differ according to the intended use. For example, "ethanol" may be treated as the identity of a specific compound or as an instance of a family of compounds with the general property "alcohols", which in turn can be seen as an instance of the general property "chemical species".

Seeing the progress and the increasing number of RMs characterized or certified for qualitative properties, ISO/REMCO decided in 2018 to start drafting internationally harmonized guidance for the production of such RMs.

This presents several issues with respect to terminology. The ISO Guide 30 definition of a certified reference material (CRM) requires it to have an RM certificate that provides the values of the specified properties, associated uncertainties and statements of metrological traceability. The relevance of metrological traceability to RMs with qualitative property values can, however, be unclear. Notes of the RM and CRM definitions in ISO Guide 30 clarify that the concept of value includes a qualitative property, such as identity or sequence, and that uncertainties for qualitative values can be expressed as probabilities or levels of confidence^[18]. However, a qualitative property has no numerical value and at present ISO Guide 98-3 (GUM) provides no methodology for assigning an uncertainty to such property values. Metrological traceability is defined in ISO/IEC Guide 99 (VIM) as a property of a measurement result whereby the result can be related to a reference through a documented unbroken chain of calibrations. Hence, it too is inapplicable to qualitative property values. Nevertheless, RMs with qualitative properties are needed now and are being produced

in increasing numbers. In order to provide meaningful guidance on these aspects of RM production, this document:

- describes how confidence in qualitative assigned values can be expressed;
- describes the relevance of a documented unbroken chain of qualitative comparisons in assigning qualitative values by comparison with qualitative references or reference information;
- notes that determination of many qualitative properties depends on data obtained with quantitative measurements and that measurement uncertainty and metrological traceability are relevant to these measurements.

These issues are discussed in detail in [5.2.2](#) and [5.3.2](#).

General requirements, structural requirements, resource requirements and management requirements for the production of RMs are described in ISO 17034. These requirements apply to the production of RMs with qualitative properties. This document supplements ISO 17034 and related guidance on the production of RMs by providing additional guidance on the value assignment and the assessment of homogeneity, stability and commutability for RMs with qualitative properties.

Approaches for the production of reference materials with qualitative properties

1 Scope

1.1 This document notes the requirements of ISO 17034 and provides guidance on the implementation of ISO 17034 in the production of RMs having one or more assigned qualitative property values, for expressing uncertainties for qualitative property values, and for establishing traceability.

NOTE The concepts of traceability and uncertainty address characteristics similar to those addressed by the concepts of traceability and measurement uncertainty as used in the metrology of quantitative properties.

1.2 This document therefore does not describe aspects related to the production of RMs with quantitative property values.

NOTE [Annex A](#) provides examples of types of RMs within the scope of this document.

2 Normative references

The following documents are referred to in the text in such a way that some or all of their content constitutes requirements of this document. For dated references, only the edition cited applies. For undated references, the latest edition of the referenced document (including any amendments) applies.

ISO 17034, *General requirements for the competence of reference material producers*

ISO Guide 30, *Reference materials — Selected terms and definitions*

ISO Guide 31, *Reference materials — Contents of certificates, labels and accompanying documentation*

ISO/IEC Guide 99, *International vocabulary of metrology — Basic and general concepts and associated terms (VIM)*

3 Terms and definitions

For the purposes of this document, the terms and definitions given in ISO 17034, ISO Guide 30, ISO Guide 31 and ISO/IEC Guide 99 apply.

ISO and IEC maintain terminology databases for use in standardization at the following addresses:

- ISO Online browsing platform: available at <https://www.iso.org/obp>
- IEC Electropedia: available at <https://www.electropedia.org/>

4 Qualitative properties

Qualitative properties, also called categorical properties, can be nominal or ordinal. A nominal property has values that divide the set of materials that have it into classes such that all the materials in the same class have the same value of the property, and the only comparison that can be made between values of the property is of whether they are identical or different. An ordinal property is similar, except that the comparisons that can be made between two values of the property are of relative rank order, i.e. whether one is lower, equal to or higher than the other. Qualitative properties can have two or more possible values. This document focuses on nominal properties.